Mixed indulgences are mixtures that claim to simultaneously satisfy consumers’ hedonic and utilitarian goals. Current research considers hedonic and utilitarian as either/or options in which pleasure and guilt are positively correlated. In contrast, this research shows that consumers perceive hedonic and utilitarian as independent constructs, further, they can de-link pleasure and guilt. Pleasantness and sin form two separate and simultaneous dimensions of the hedonic construct. This de-linking has implications for mixed indulgences which may be perceived to be equally pleasant though less sinful than pure indulgences. Despite this perception, mixed indulgences are less likely to be chosen relative to pure indulgences. A co-activation and arousal explanation is proposed. Pleasantness and sin are co-activated in indulgence, which elicits arousal. This arousal is desirable in the context of indulgence – consequently removing sin from a pure indulgence reduces the co-activation and arousal, and leads to lower choice for the mixed indulgence.